

**Village of Holmen
Board of Review
October 15, 2019**

Clerk/Treasurer Hornberg called the Holmen Board of Review hearing proceedings to order at 4:00 pm on October 15, 2019, at the Holmen Village Hall.

Roll call was taken: Patrick Barlow, Doug Jorstad, Angie Hornberg and Rich Anderson were all present. Hornberg identified herself as appointed and a member of the Board of Review; also in attendance were Officer Joe Hickey, as well as Village Administrator Scott Heinig. Clerk/Treasurer Hornberg announced that a full market revaluation was prepared by Associated Appraisal.

Hornberg announced that a Class 1 notice was filed in the August 16, 2019 paper; an affidavit of publication is available in our Village files. Notices were posted in the Village Office, on the Village website, in the Holmen Library and Holmen Area Post Office on August 13, 2019. Meeting notices were posted at the same locations on August 13, 2019.

Hornberg reminded the Board that at the May 28, 2019 adjournment meeting, this body approved Patrick Barlow as Board of Review chairperson and Doug Jorstad as Board of Review vice chairperson for the 2019 Board of Review.

Hornberg stated that she, as well as President Barlow, fulfilled the training requirement for Board of Review; affidavits have been filed with the State of Wisconsin.

Hornberg mentioned that the assessment roll was received on September 18, 2019; the roll was reviewed by the Clerk. Open book was held on September 18, 2019, from 11:00 am to 7:00 pm and September 19, 2019, from 8:00 am to 1:00 pm. She also stated that the assessor signed the affidavit in the Clerk's presence today; notices were sent to property owners 15 days prior to Board of Review. She affirmed with Mr. Robley that changes made during open book have been made in the current roll which was signed today.

Hornberg swore in the Village Assessor, Tony Robley, of Associated Appraisal. Mr. Robley provided comps, reviewed class comparisons and statistics. He mentioned that the average increase for properties during the revaluation was 32.4%, which included new construction; the actual economic change was more in the 29-30% range. This includes all commercial and residential; Holmen is now in compliance for all classes. He pointed out that one of the biggest changes was land values; he explained how the values were determined using sales information in locations wherever possible. Administrator Heinig inquired as to the correlation with methodology for lots that are similar sizes but still vary in square footage. For instance, lots on the same street with varied sizes and varied costs per acre; he inquired how that would happen. Robley stated that size of the lot didn't seem to be a determining factor after the first 10,000 square feet; for instance, a lot may be calculated at \$4.20 for the first 10,000 square feet, after that per square foot value drops. The assessors found that there was little extra added value for additional square footage. Therefore, a 12,000 square foot lot averages out lower per square foot. Heinig remarked that the market doesn't support an apple to apple comparison of lots; the end result of the number doesn't come from a simplistic calculation. Robley pointed out that in real estate, what you typically see is the law of diminishing return; the more you have, the more its worth, but at a declining rate. Heinig asked if there were any additional questions of the assessor at this time. Robley stated that they could go over additional information once the appointments wrapped up.

At 4:20 pm, Clerk/Treasurer Hornberg welcomed Ms. Schultz and introduced the first case; Kathleen Schultz who was there to speak on behalf of parcel 14-170-002 which is located at 1609 Holley Street. Hornberg confirmed Ms. Schultz was prepared to state her case and swore her in for testimony. Schultz stated that the property in question has had continual problems with street flooding ever since they put curb and gutters in about 40 some years ago, and there have been no improvements. Due to recent heavy rains, the street was blocked off for days; her property was not flooded but she fears it will in the future. Ms. Schultz doesn't understand how there can't be resolution on the street problem, and she also feels her water quality is very poor. She doesn't agree with her assessment; she doesn't feel the property is worth this amount taking into consideration the water quality and street flooding. Hornberg confirmed Ms. Schultz had completed her testimony at this time.

Hornberg then affirmed that Mr. Robley had been previously sworn in and asked him to begin his testimony on property 14-170-002. He pointed out that currently land on this property was assessed at \$43,800 and improvements at \$117,900 for a total of \$161,700. He provided the property record report on the house; he reviewed the specs on the home which includes one additional outbuilding. Robley also presented a map showing the location of the home and values for comparable houses about the same age; all on Holley Street. Sales in those areas ranged from \$179,000 to \$186,500 for homes that are very similar to the subject property. Evidence shows that issues that were brought up the night of Board of Review have not caused issues with sales in the area. Robley pointed out that the lot size of the subject was actually bigger than all of the comparables he presented.

Administrator Heinig commented that for the Board's consideration with regards to the unfortunate concerns of the applicant, although he sympathizes with those issues with design of the Holley Street area, it does not provide a legal denial of the comps that were before them justified by the assessor in the property report. Under the circumstances with regards to the law, it would be his recommendation that they uphold the assessor's findings.

Chairperson Barlow asked if the Board members had any additional questions regarding this property. He mentioned that staff recommended upholding the assessor's values. He outlined the possible motions at the time: to uphold the assessor's valuation or to make a change. Barlow asked if anyone wanted to make a motion.

Motion by Hornberg, seconded by Jorstad to uphold the assessor's valuation as correct. The motion carried unanimously.

Clerk/Treasurer Hornberg completed form PR-302 and provided a copy to Ms. Schultz.

Chairperson Barlow inquired as to how significant changes to property should be reported to the assessor; could these changes be addressed and updated through the open book process? Robley stated the property owner needs to notify the assessor of any significant changes or concerns as part of the assessment process. Barlow inquired about outbuildings and their value to the property; Robley stated that if the outbuilding is attached it is included in the value of the home, if it is unattached it would have a separate value.

At 4:35 pm, Clerk/Treasurer Hornberg introduced the next case; Andrew Campbell who was there to speak on behalf of parcel 14-1553-000 located at 3412 Brook Lane. Hornberg confirmed Mr. Campbell was prepared to state his case and swore him in for testimony. Mr. Campbell stated part of the reason he

was in attendance that day was for his information; he was not made aware of the upcoming revaluation when he purchased the home. He mentioned that he felt he should have received an assessment letter in March but since he purchased the home in April, he had not received any notice until last week. Campbell said he did not feel it was fair to value the home based on what he paid for it; he felt that was really easy. He stated that they have a wooden foundation and are located on a flood plain, and he has some erosion issues. It is the market value because yes, that was what he paid for it; because he liked it, he didn't feel that was what the home should be assessed at. He stated that it is a 44-year-old home and to jack it up to what he paid for it is not fair because that is what his taxes are based on so he was of course upset about it. He stated that he doesn't know how the mill rate works but he doesn't want to see his taxes go up 60% because of being overassessed. He understands land value is going to increase but he doesn't understand why the home value would go up. He stated that his realtor agreed that he had a valid claim to object to the valuation. Hornberg confirmed Mr. Campbell had completed her testimony at this time. Hornberg commented that indeed, the mill rate does drop significantly after a reval so the numbers that he was looking at are not as high as he may think, and assessment letters are typically mailed out in March each year. However this year, due to the revaluation, they were mailed out in August so the time to discuss the values was now. Campbell stated somebody told him that he missed the time to discuss his values. Hornberg confirmed again that this was the time to discuss the values for 2019. Hornberg again asked if Mr. Campbell had anything additional to add and outlined how the procedure would continue today. She welcomed him to stay for the assessor testimony and the Board of Review's decision.

Hornberg then affirmed that Mr. Robley had been previously sworn in and asked him to begin his testimony on property 14-1553-000. Robley provided the property record report, confirmed that currently land on this property was assessed at \$42,000 and improvements at \$226,600 for a total of \$268,600. He reviewed the specs on the property including the finished area in the lower level of the home, as well as several outbuildings which included an additional garage, swimming pool and canopy features that makes this property different from the comps provided. Robley noted that they did make some adjustments to the land value during open book for the west side of Brook Lane for the property in response to reported flood plain concerns. He pointed out the values for the additional features was \$25,000 so when you review the slightly lower comps, consider this additional value. He mentioned that the biggest bit of information to support his valuation comes from form PA115A where the opinion of value was \$215,000 but the purchase price of the home was \$273,000 on April 28, 2019. State guidelines for the assessor state the assessor shall consider recent arm's length sales to determine value of a property as the first criteria. Robley pointed out that the assessed value was at \$268,600 and the sale was \$273,000, therefore he did not feel this property was overassessed at all. He inquired as to any questions the Board may have.

Mr. Campbell indicated that the value on the property report for land was not the same as the land value as stated on the letter that he received. Mr. Robley stated that was because of the adjustments that they made for all properties on the west side of Brook Lane due to the flood plain concern. Administrator Heinig inquired as to the value for land on Mr. Campbell's letter. Campbell stated it was \$46,700. Heinig confirmed that the land value was adjusted down to \$42,000. Robley stated that was an adjustment of 10% to the land value. Campbell asked if a state standard was used for the adjustment. Robley stated that no, there was no state standard and that values were adjusted after reviewing each situation on an individual basis. Robley stated again that this property is larger and has a bigger lot than the comps available, and the home was overall in good condition. Mr. Campbell stated that the garage, as well as the home, was 44 years old and neither have block; they are wooden walls set on a slab and in the flood zone. He also had issues with leaking, and the street only has one sewer drain so there is nasty

runoff. Campbell felt some things have been overlooked; he inquired as to the age of the other homes in the comps, and stated that he had nothing else to add. Robley stated that some of the comps were newer but that the MLS description of the home confirmed the many upgrades that had been made to the home so it is an older home but has updates.

Administrator Heinig commented that with regards to the legal requirements imposed by the assessor, with the comps for the regional community and the actual market sale of the property, there was no legal reason to object to the overall value as proposed with the amount of amenities on site, it appeared to be accurate within the comps as listed.

Chairperson Barlow stated that they had received staff opinion and received testimony from the homeowner as well as the assessor; he asked if anyone on the Board had additional questions. He stated that they could entertain two motions: to uphold the Assessors valuation as correct, or a motion to change the valuation.

Motion by Jorstad, seconded by Anderson to uphold the assessor's valuation as correct. The motion carried unanimously.

Clerk/Treasurer Hornberg completed form PR-302 and provided a copy to Mr. Campbell.

At 4:53 pm, all objections filed with 48 hours' notice had been heard, therefore they would go off the record for the time being. Administrator Heinig excused Officer Hickey.

At 5:55 pm, a homeowner from Crooked Avenue asked to speak on behalf of her property. Administrator Heinig stated that due to the 48 hour requirement not being met, the Board of Review would be unable to hear her testimony that evening. He offered to let her ask questions of the assessor but the BOR could not act on her concern. Hornberg inquired as to if she had attended open book; she stated that she had. Heinig apologized and remarked that without her following the appropriate legal process, the judicial action of the Board could not assist her. She stated the initial assessment was reduced by \$8,000 at open book but she still felt that it was too high; she asked if there was any other process to address her concerns. Heinig stated that for 2019, there was no further recourse.

Barlow stated that the Board of Review had heard all of the cases before them and thoroughly discussed questions of the assessor on work that they had done; he entertained a motion to adjourn. Motion by Jorstad, seconded by Anderson to adjourn. Carried unanimously.

Chairman Barlow closed the hearing at 6:00 pm.

Angela A. Hornberg
Village Clerk/Treasurer